**OBRANA DOKTORSKOGA RADA**

**Željka Maurović Benko**

**PROBLEM SIROMAŠTVA I UČINKOVITI**

**ALTRUIZAM U FILOZOFIJI PETERA SINGERA**

članovi Povjerenstva:

doc. dr. sc. Luka Janeš, predsjednik

prof. dr. sc. Ivan Šestak, član

prof. dr. sc. Ivo Džinić, vanjski član

Obrana će se održati

**utorak, 25. lipnja 2024. u 10.00 sati**

u Vijećnici Fakulteta (1. kat)

**SAŽETAK**

Predmet je istraživanja ove disertacije utvrditi kako prevladavanju problema siromaštva doprinosi učinkoviti altruizam i kakvo uporište učinkoviti altruizam ima u filozofiji Petera Singera. Siromaštvo je zacijelo najveće neriješeno pitanje suvremene civilizacije. Uz siromaštvo su neraskidivo vezane pojave prirodnih katastrofa i ratova kao uzroci, te bolesti i glad kao posljedice. Velik broj istraživača i njihov živ interes za predmet istraživanja omogućili su oblikovanje brojnih teorija, više ili manje konzistentnih koje, osim identifikacije uzroka, nude i rješenja za smanjivanje ili eliminaciju siromaštva. Jedna od takvih filozofskih teorija razvila se u društveni pokret koji potiče pojedince da koriste razum i dokaze kako bi maksimalno povećali svoj pozitivan utjecaj na svijet i pomogli drugima što je učinkovitije moguće. To je učinkoviti altruizam, praktična primjena etičkog okvira koja nalaže pojedincima davanje prioriteta onim radnjama i ciljevima koji mogu učiniti najviše dobra, čak i ako to znači žrtvovanje nekih osobnih preferencija ili pogodnosti. Početnom razvoju i popularizaciji učinkovitog altruizma značajno su doprinijela filozofska i etička razmatranja Petera Singera. U svrhu dubljeg proučavanja odabranog predmeta, definirana su tri istraživačka pitanja:

* P1 – Je li etička teorija učinkovitoga altruizma Petera Singera značajno utjecala na suvremena promišljanja o problemu siromaštva u svijetu?
* P2 – Mogu li pozitivne dužnosti, kao nezaobilazan dio učinkovitoga altruizma, jednakomjerno obvezati svakoga pojedinca?
* P3 – Je li uloga dobrotvornih organizacija, kao posrednika u pružanju pomoći najsiromašnijim državama, dovoljno učinkovita?

U traženju odgovora o mogućem utjecaju Singerove teorije na suvremena promišljanja o siromaštvu, prikazan je filozofski i etički profil Petera Singera, i to uvidom u njegov doprinos utilitarističkoj teorijskoj misli i pregledom njegova razmatranja etike globalnog siromaštva. Problem siromaštva u fokusu Petera Singera detaljno je istražen, najprije kao prikaz odabranih istraživanja o apsolutnom i relativnom siromaštvu, a zatim kao Singerovo razmatranje tih istih pojmova. Nakon prikaza Singereova argumenta o siromaštvu i njegove rasprave o siromaštvu, ukratko su prikazani teoretičari koji razvijaju altruističku teoriju. Svrha ovog prikaza bila je pokazati kako su brojni teoretičari, istaknuti u svjetskoj znanstvenoj povijesti na različitim područjima, posvetili pozornost teoriji kojom se Singer bavio, čime se može dokazati njezina važnost u predmetu istraživanja. Nakon toga navedeno je Singerovo mišljenje kako je za pronalazak pouzdanih organizacija u pružanju učinkovite pomoći dobro tražiti preporuku *GiveWell* neprofitne organizacije, koja se bavi upravo analizom učinkovitosti ulaganja pojedinih dobrotvornih organizacija. U ovom su odjeljku navedena su mišljenja i drugih teoretičara što pokazuje širinu pokreta učinkovitog altruizma u teoriji i u praktičnom djelovanju mnogih istaknutih znanstvenika. U odjeljku o tezama drugih autora, koji su se više ili manje bavili pitanjima siromaštva, vezanima uz učinkoviti altruizam, prikazani su i oni autori koji su učinkoviti altruizam sagledavali vrlo kritički. Nakon analize altruističke teorije, kao podloge za teoriju učinkovitog altruizma, izvršen je kratak pregled odabranih filozofa, ekonomista, matematičara i sociologa koji su se referirali na probleme ublažavanja siromaštva u svijetu. Budući da postoji velik broj uglednih autora koji nisu obuhvaćeni prikazom u ovom radu, a koji su se uključili u raspravu o etičkim, društvenim i gospodarskim pitanjima vezanima uz teoriju učinkovitog altruizma, potvrđena je relevantnost predmeta istraživanja. Subjektivan odabir najznačajnijih autora sukladan je kvalitativnoj analizi koja počiva na mišljenju selektiranih eksperata, jedino s tom razlikom što za potrebe ovog rada nisu vođeni intervjui, već je izvršena analiza objavljenih tekstova. Zbog svega navedenog, odgovor na postavljeno istraživačko pitanje (P1) je pozitivan:

* *etička teorija učinkovitoga altruizma Petera Singera izvršila je značajan i pozitivan utjecaj na suvremena promišljanja o problemu siromaštva u svijetu.*

U traženju odgovora na drugo istraživačko pitanje jesu li dužnosti, kao nezaobilazan dio učinkovitoga altruizma Petera Singera, savršene i mogu li one jednakomjerno obvezati svakoga pojedinca, istražena je važnost dužnosti i emocija u rješavanju pitanja siromaštva. Pitanjima dužnosti i pravilima izvorno se bavi deontološka etika utemeljena na Kantovoj tezi da pojedinci imaju moralnu obvezu djelovati u skladu s kategoričkim imperativima, tj. univerzalnim moralnim zakonima koji se podjednako primjenjuju na sva razumna bića. Konzekvencijalističke teorije, poput utilitarizma, naglašavaju posljedice radnji premda prihvaćaju deontološku koncepciju dužnosti u smislu univerzalnosti i nepristranosti. U utilitarizmu, moralna je obveza maksimizirati ukupnu sreću ili zadovoljstvo i minimizirati patnju. Etičnost neke radnje prosuđuju se na temelju njezina ishoda, a pojedinci imaju obvezu odabrati one radnje koje vode najvećem općem dobru. Kontraktualizam kao etički pravac utemeljen je na ideji društvenog ugovora, a utvrđuje da obveze proizlaze iz principa djelovanja na koje bi racionalni pojedinci pristali pod poštenim i jednakim uvjetima. Bez obzira jesu li potaknuti univerzalnim moralnim zakonima ili društvenim ugovorima, pojedinci imaju mogućnost da se, u izvršavanju svojih dužnosti prema najsiromašnijima, ponašaju indiferentno ili supererogativno, pri čemu je potonje najčešće vezano uz milosrđe. Razmatrajući emocije u pružanju pomoći svakako je razumljivo da su i one važne, ponajviše kao motivacija prilikom pružanja pomoći. Singerovo rješenje problema siromaštva ima tendenciju stvoriti *procjep* između emocija i morala, jer je su za njega emocije potpuno irelevantne, iako brojni filantropi i volonteri djeluju u sklopu dobrotvornih organizacija na osnovi suosječanja i empatije. Singer također relativizira udaljenost kao otežavajuči čimbenik u pružanju pomoći, uspoređujući pomoć siromašnima iz zemalja Trećeg svijeta sa primjerom malenog djeteta koje se utapa u plitkom ribnjaku u našoj neposrednoj blizini. Pri tome ne uzima u obzir da je spašavanje utopljenika stvar intuitivnog djelovanja, uzrokovanog hitnim stanjem, koje uključuje jednu jednostavnu radnju koja mijenja sudbinu utopljenika, a promjena globalnog siromaštva uključuje aktivno sudjelovanje državnih institucija i trajnu promjenu uvjeta. Uz to je Singerov argument pretežak, a time u praktičnom životu tek djelomično provediv. Zbog svega navedenog, odgovor na drugo istraživačko pitanje (P2) negativan je:

* *dužnosti, kao nezaobilazan dio učinkovitoga altruizma Petera Singera, su poztitivne, odnosno nesavršene i ne mogu jednakomjerno obvezati svakoga pojedinca.*

U traženju odgovora na treće istraživačko pitanje je li uloga dobrotvornih organizacija, kao posrednika u pružanju pomoći najsiromašnijim državama, dovoljno učinkovita, sačinjen je pregled različitih oblika pomaganja i institucionalnog doprinosa pružanju pomoći. Različiti oblici pružanja parcijalne pomoći potrebitima jesu nužni, točnije neizostavni su u svakom trenutku, ali niti jedan od njih nije usmjeren na trajno prevladavanje siromaštva kao što je to doprinos održivom razvoju. Održivi razvoj najprije je ekonomska kategorija koja obuhvaća problem gospodarskog napretka, zatim je ekološka kategorija koja uzima u obzir očuvanje prirodnog okoliša, iskorištavanje ograničenih resursa i zagađivanje te napokon, to je socijalna kategorija koja bi trebala omogućiti svim ljudima dostojanstven životni standard uz odgovarajuću zdravstvenu skrb i slobodan pristup obrazovanju. Posebna pozornost u traženju odgovara na istraživačko pitanje, posvećena je institucionalnim dobrotvorima tj. različitim organizacijama koje su specijalizirane za pružanje pomoći. Njihova snaga i moć daleko nadilazi moć pojedinaca, ali postoje primjeri i ekstremno bogatih pojedinaca i obitelji koji su značajan dio svoje imovine usmjerili u pružanje dobrotvorne pomoći. Dobrotvorne zaklade prikazane su kao pravni oblik za prikupljanje pomoći i njezinu distribuciju te su prikazane neke od najpoznatijih i najutjecajnijih dobrotvornih organizacija u svijetu. One prikupljaju pomoć od pojedinaca, poduzeća pa i države, a najčešće su posvećene odabranom području djelatnosti ili geografskoj regiji na koje pretežito usmjeravaju svoju pomoć. Navedeni su neki primjeri uspješnih dobrotvornih aktivnosti, ali su prikazani i problemi ili neuspjesi koji su se pojavili u radu odabranih organizacija. Ovaj prikaz omogućio je da se procijeni je li uloga dobrotvornih organizacija, kao posrednika u pružanju pomoći najsiromašnijim državama, dovoljno učinkovita. Dobrotvorne organizacije značajno doprinose ublažavanju gladi i siromaštva, pomažu unesrećenim pojedincima i čitavim zajednicama u stradalim regijama, ali ne utječu na trajno rješavanje siromaštva u svijetu. Zato je i odgovor na istraživačko pitanje (P3) negativan:

* *dobrotvorne organizacije, kao posrednici u pružanju pomoći najsiromašnijim državama, nisu dovoljno učinkovite.*

Ovaj negativan odgovor ne bi trebao obeshrabriti buduću potporu institucionalnim dobrotvorima jer, bez obzira što se još uvijek nije pronašlo rješenje za trajno smanjivanje siromaštva, svi napori na ublažavanju problema itekako su važni onima kojima je pomoć najpotrebnija. Isto tako, učinkoviti altruizam kao filozofska i etička teorijska podloga praktičnim aktivnostima, daje značajne rezultate na ublažavanju gladi i siromaštva u svijetu, potiče zagovaranje dobrotvornih aktivnosti i primjenom znanstvenih metoda traži najbolje projekte koji postižu najveći učinak. Peter Singer kao pojedinac, postigao je ogromne rezultate svojim znanstvenim istraživanjima, otvarao je i poticao globalnu raspravu o etičkim problemima, izvršio značajan utjecaj na čitavu generaciju moralnih filozofa, pomogao je u oblikovanju teorije učinkovitog altruizma, a što je još važnije, svojim je utjecajem djelovao i na poslovne ljude te je generirao brojna praktična djelovanja koja su dovela do osnivanja uspješnih dobrotvornih organizacija. Peter Singer nije trajno riješio pitanje gladi i siromaštva u svijetu, ali je njegov doprinos ublažavanju problema globalno važan i učinkovit.

**Ključne riječi:** donacije, Peter Singer, siromaštvo, učinkoviti altruizam

**EXTENDED SUMMARY**

The subject of research in this dissertation is to determine how effective altruism contributes to overcoming the problem of poverty and what basis effective altruism has in the philosophy of Peter Singer.Poverty is probably the biggest unresolved issue of modern civilization.Inextricably linked to poverty are natural disasters and wars, as causes, and diseases and hunger as consequences.Given the importance of poverty, in the context of the development of the human community, poverty is the subject of research by numerous scientists in the scientific fields of economics and philosophy, within the social sciences and humanities.A large number of researchers and their keen interest in the subject of research have enabled the formation of numerous theories, more or less consistent, which, in addition to identifying causes, also offer solutions for reducing or eliminating poverty.One such philosophical theory has developed into a social movement that encourages individuals to use reason and evidence to maximize their positive impact on the world and help others as effectively as possible.Effective altruism combines elements of ethics, economics, and decision theory to address global challenges and improve the well-being of individuals, especially those who are most vulnerable.It is a practical application of an ethical framework that involves using reason and evidence to identify the most effective ways to make a positive impact.The application of effective altruism requires individuals to prioritize those actions and goals that can do the most good, even if this means sacrificing some personal preferences or conveniences.Effective altruism, as a formal movement, began to take shape at the beginning of the 21st century, and its roots can be traced in the works and ideas of a large number ofindividuals.However, in the early development and popularization of effective altruism, the contribution of the philosophy and ethics of Peter Singer is indispensable.For the purpose of a deeper study of the selected subject, three research questions were asked:

1. *Q1-Has Peter Singer's ethical theory of effective altruism significantly influenced contemporary reflections on the problem of poverty in the world?*
2. *P2-Canthe positive duties, as an indispensable part of effective altruism, obligate each individual equally?*
3. *Q3-Is the role of charitable organizations, as mediators in providing aid to the poorest countries, effective enough?*In seeking for an answer to the first research question about the possible influence of Singer's theory on contemporary reflections on poverty, the philosophical and ethical profile of Peter Singer is presented, with an insight into his
4. the ethics of global poverty.

The problem of poverty in the focus of Peter Singer is explored in detail, first as a presentation of selected research on absolute and relative poverty, and then as Singer's consideration of these same concepts.After the presentation of Singer's argument about poverty and his discussion about poverty, theorists who develop the altruistic theory are briefly presented: August Comte, Charles Darwin, Peter Kropotkin, Emil Durkheim,Richard Dawkins, Georg Price, Martin Nowak, and Robert Trivers. The purpose ofthis presentation was to show how numerous theoreticians, prominent in the world's scientific history in various fields, paid attention to the theory that Singer dealt with, which can prove its importance in the subject of research.After that, Singer's opinion was stated that in order to find reliable organizations in the provision of effective aid, a good solution is to seek the recommendation of the GiveWell non-profit organization, which deals precisely with the analysis of the effectiveness of the investments of individual charitable organizations.Other theorists are listed in this section: William MacAskill, Julia Wise, Derek Parfit, Nick Bostrom, Peter Unger, and Thomas Nagel. A brief overview of the above-mentioned authors shows the breadth of the movement of effective altruism in theory and in the practical actions of many prominent scientists.In the section on the theses of other authors who more or less dealt with issues of poverty, related to effective altruism, those authors who looked at effective altruism very critically are presented: Toby Ord, Amartya Sen, Martha Nussbaum, Esther Duflo and Abhijit Banerjee, Angus Deaton, Paul Edward Farmer, Barbara Ehrenreich, Katherine Boo, Jeffrey D. Sachs, and Thomas Piketty. Criticism of the so-calledSinger's solution contains a representation of different individuals who incorporate unique views into the complex field of ethics, justice and social responsibility.It is presented in more detail. Thomas Pogge wants to answer some key questions related to the issue of poverty, namely the prevalence of absolute poverty, the prevalence of inequality, and the direction of movement in the future, that is, whether poverty will increase or decrease in the future.Corinna Mieth, who dealt with the question of how poverty reduces the life expectancy of affected people, was also singled out.The capability approach and Catholic Social Teaching are presented as an alternative to effective altruism, noting that there are numerous points of contact in the joint effort to overcome poverty.After the analysis of the altruistic theory, as a basis for the theory of effective altruism, a brief overview of selected philosophers, economists, mathematicians and sociologists who referred to the problems of poverty alleviation in the world was made. Since there is a large number of distinguished authors, who are not included in the presentation in this paper, and who have joined the discussion on ethical, social and economic issues related to the theory of effective altruism, the relevance of the research subject has been confirmed. The subjective selection of the most important authors is consistent with the qualitative analysis based on the opinion of selected experts, with the only difference that for the purposes of this work, interviews were not conducted, but an analysis of published texts was performed. Due to all of the above, the answer to the research question (P1) is positive:

1. ***Peter Singer's ethical theory of effective altruism has had a significant and positive impact on contemporary reflections on the problem of poverty in the world.***

In search of an answer to the second research question, whether duties, as an indispensable part of effective altruism in Peter Singer, are perfect and whether they can equally oblige every individual, the importance of duties and emotions in solving the issue of poverty was investigated.Issues of duty and rules are originally dealt with by deontological ethics based on Kant's thesis that individuals have a moral obligation to act in accordance with categorical imperatives, i.e. universal moral laws that apply equally to all rational beings.Consequentialist theories, like utilitarianism, emphasize the consequences of actions, although they accept a deontological conception of duty.In utilitarianism, the moral obligation is to maximize total happiness or pleasure and minimize suffering.The ethicality of an action is judged based on its outcome, and individuals have an obligation to choose those actions that lead to the greatest common good.Aristotle's virtue ethics focuses on the development of virtuous character traits.Although it does not prescribe specific duties in the way that deontological ethics does, virtue ethics emphasizes the importance of cultivating virtues such as courage, honesty, and compassion.Individuals have an obligation to develop a virtuous character and to act in such a way that in their activities they express the aforementioned virtues.Social contracts, such as those advanced by John Rawls, propose that individuals have moral duties based on social contracts or agreements.Contractualism as an ethical direction establishes that obligations arise from principles of action that rational individuals would agree to under fair and equal conditions.Rawls conducts an interesting consideration of duty by separating individual duties from institutional duties, but synthesizing them as priority rules that apply to both institutional and individual principles. Regardless of whether they are motivated by universal moral laws or social contracts, individuals have the option to act indifferently or supererogatively, the latter being most often related to charity, in fulfilling their duties towards the poorest.Considering emotions in the provision of aid, it is certainly understandable that they are important both as a driver of charitable activities and as a behavior of the recipient of emotions.Empathy is probably the biggest driver, and happiness the most widespread feeling after giving help, although Mill called the whole utilitarian theory "the theory of happiness" in an effort to show the importance of happiness in helpers.Duflo highlighted hope as the most important emotion in recipients of charity, although it can be expected that hope of possible improvements also exists in providers of aid.Duties, regardless of whether they are motivated by external or internal factors, moral and social obligations or emotions, are subjective and therefore difficult to objectify as perfect.Perfectionism in human behavior, in itself, is subjective because it is based on personal interpretations, standards and expectations, and not on objective, universally defined criteria.Since duties are subjective because they are inextricablylinked to emotions, and even if they would achieve perfection in their actions, which is possible but not necessary, duties must be objectively accepted as an imperfect category.Thus, one part of the research question is tied to a negative answer.Duties bind each individual, but not in the same way and not to the same extent, so that, regardless of their imperfection, or precisely because of it, it cannot be expected that duties could bind all individuals to provide charitable assistance.We see that in human communities, even those duties that are prescribed by law and whose non-fulfillment is punished by the repressive apparatus of the state are not respected.Due to all of the above, the answer to the second research question (P2) is negative:

1. ***Duties, as an indispensable part of effective altruism in Peter Singer, are not perfect and cannot obligate each individual equally.***

In seeking an answer to the third research question, whether the role of charitable organizations, as mediators in providing aid to the poorest countries, is effective enough, an overview of different forms of aid and institutional contribution to aid was made.Different forms of providing partial assistance to the needy are necessary, more precisely, they are indispensable at all times, but none of them is aimed at permanently overcoming poverty, as it is a contribution to sustainable development.Sustainable development is firstly an economic category that includes the problem of economic progress, then it is an ecological category that takes into account the preservation of the natural environment, the exploitation of limited resources and pollution, and finally, it is a social category that should enable all people a dignified standard of living with adequate health careand free access to education.Sustainable development is not only in the interest of today's generation, it is a question of the survival of children and all future generations.Special attention, in seeking answers to the research question, is devoted to institutional benefactors, i.e. different organizations that specialize in providing aid.Their strength and power far exceeds the power of individuals, but there are also examples of extremely wealthy individuals and families who have directed a significant portion of their assets to provide charitable assistance.Charitable foundations are shown as a legal form for collecting aid and distributing it, and some of the most famous and influential charitable organizations in the world are shown.They collect aid from individuals, companies and even the state, and are most often dedicated to a selected field of activity or a geographic region to which they mainly direct their aid.The influence of Peter Singer and his like-minded people, who developed effective altruism, on the actions of institutional benefactors is especially shown.The GiveWell organization was singled out, which does not provide aid directly, but operates according to the principles of effective altruism, seeking investments and projects that achieve the greatest impact.The analyzes of the GiveWell organization include numerous projects and benefactors, on a global level, they are completely transparent and objective, and the goal is to find and publicize the most effective activities.Based on such announcements, each potential donor can choose those projects and those investments that best match his personal preferences and that allow him to believe that he has invested his funds usefully.Some examples of successful charitable activities are listed, but problems or failures that have arisen in the work of selected organizations are also presented.This presentation made it possible to assess whether the role of charitable organizations, as mediators in providing aid to the poorest countries, is sufficiently effective.Charitable organizations contribute significantly to the alleviation of hunger and poverty, they help distressed individuals and entire communities in affected regions, but they do not affect the permanent solution to poverty in the world.That is why the answer to the research question is P3.negative:

1. ***Charitable organizations, as mediators in providing aid to the poorest countries, are not efficient enough.***

This negative response should not discourage future support from institutional philanthropists because, regardless of the fact that no solution has yet been found to permanently reduce poverty, all efforts to alleviate the problem are very important to those who need help the most.Likewise, effective altruism, as a philosophical and ethical theoretical basis for practical activities, gives significant results in alleviating hunger and poverty in the world, encourages the advocacy of charitable activities and, by applying scientific methods, searches for the best projects that achieve the greatest effect.Peter Singer, as an individual, achieved enormous results with his scientific research, opened and encouraged a global debate on ethical problems, exerted a significant influence on an entire generation of moral philosophers, helped shape the theory of effective altruism, and what is even more important, with his influencealso influenced business people and generated numerous practical actions that led to the establishment of successful charitable organizations.Peter Singer did not permanently solve the problem of hunger and poverty in the world, but his contribution to alleviating the problem is globally important and effective.

**Key words:** donations, Peter Singer, poverty, effective altruism